

## ***Supplementary Materials: Cooperation and Artificial Intelligence: A Critical Review across Governance, Ethics, and Democracy***

### ***Materiali aggiuntivi: Cooperazione e Intelligenza Artificiale: Una revisione critica tra Governance, Etica e Democrazia***

Elisabetta Miraglio

AlmaVico; Alma Mater Università di Bologna (Italy); [e.miraglio@coode.it](mailto:e.miraglio@coode.it)  
<https://orcid.org/0009-0008-1490-8454>

Luca Ferrari

Department of Education Studies “G. M. Bertin”; Alma Mater Università di Bologna (Italy); [l.ferrari@unibo.it](mailto:l.ferrari@unibo.it)  
<https://orcid.org/0000-0001-7853-449X>

Claudia Beatrice Elena Iormetti

Head of Social Innovation; Open Group Coop. Soc. (Italy); [claudia.iormetti@opengroup.eu](mailto:claudia.iormetti@opengroup.eu)  
<https://orcid.org/0009-0005-0060-5119>

#### **HOW TO CITE**

Miraglio, E., Ferrari, L., & Iormetti, C. (2026). *Supplementary Materials: Cooperation and Artificial Intelligence: A Critical Review across Governance, Ethics, and Democracy*. *Formazione & Insegnamento*, 24(2), A1–A5. Retrieved from <https://ojs.pensamultimedia.it/index.php/siref/article/view/8398>

## Bibliografia dei contributi selezionati per la *Scoping Review*

- Asa, Y., Kato, T., & Mine, R. (2023). Composite consensus-building process: Permissible meeting analysis and compromise choice exploration. In Y. Maemura, M. Horita, L. Fang, & P. Zaraté (Eds.), *Group decision and negotiation in the era of multimodal interactions: GDN 2023* (pp. 97–112). Springer. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-33780-2\\_7](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-33780-2_7)
- Benton, P. (2024). Democratic AI: Justification for a broad view of public reason. In A. Gerber, J. Maritz, & A. W. Pillay (Eds.), *Artificial intelligence research: SACAIR 2024* (pp. 440–455). Springer. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-78255-8\\_26](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-78255-8_26)
- Blasimme, A., Vayena, E., & Hafen, E. (2018). Democratizing health research through data cooperatives. *Philosophy & Technology*, 31(3), 473–479. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s13347-018-0320-8>
- Bruder, R., Stockinger, C., Petrat, D., & Subtil, I. (2021). Development of cooperative artificial intelligence (AI) applications to support human work in manufacturing. In N. L. Black, W. P. Neumann, & I. Noy (Eds.), *Proceedings of the 21st Congress of the International Ergonomics Association: IEA 2021* (pp. 391–397). Springer. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-74608-7\\_49](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-74608-7_49)
- Calzada, I. (2023). Disruptive technologies for e-diasporas: Blockchain, DAOs, data cooperatives, metaverse, and ChatGPT. *Futures*, 154, Article 103258. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.futures.2023.103258>
- Calzada, I. (2024a). Artificial intelligence for social innovation: Beyond the noise of algorithms and datafication. *Sustainability*, 16(19), Article 8638. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su16198638>
- Calzada, I. (2024b). Democratic erosion of data-opolies: Decentralized Web3 technological paradigm shift amidst AI disruption. *Big Data and Cognitive Computing*, 8(3), Article 26. <https://doi.org/10.3390/bdcc8030026>
- Calzati, S., & van Loenen, B. (2023). Towards a citizen- and citizenry-centric digitalization of the urban environment: Urban digital twinning as commoning. *Digital Society*, 2(3), Article 38. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s44206-023-00064-0>
- Carballa Smichowski, B. (2019). Alternative data governance models: Moving beyond one-size-fits-all solutions. *Intereconomics*, 54(4), 222–227. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10272-019-0828-x>
- Cecchini, D., Pflanzner, M., & Dubljević, V. (2025). Aligning artificial intelligence with moral intuitions: An intuitionist approach to the alignment problem. *AI Ethics*, 5(2), 1523–1533. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s43681-024-00496-5>
- Chen, J., Zhang, D., Qu, Z., & Wang, C. (2022). Modeling adaptive empathy based on neutral assessment: A way to enhance the prosocial behaviors of socialized agents under the premise of self-security. *Applied Intelligence*, 52, 6692–6722. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10489-021-02712-9>
- Cheng, Y., Zhang, W., Zhang, Z., Zhang, C., Wang, S., & Mao, S. (2024). Towards federated large language models: Motivations, methods, and future directions. *IEEE Communications Surveys & Tutorials*, 27(4), 2733–2764. <https://doi.org/10.1109/COMST.2024.3503680>
- Cherner, T., Foulger, T. S., & Donnelly, M. (2025). Introducing a generative AI decision tree for higher education: A synthesis of ethical considerations from published frameworks & guidelines. *TechTrends*, 69(1), 84–99. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11528-024-01023-3>
- Cocchiaro, M. Z., Morley, J., Novelli, C., Panai, E., Tartaro, A., & Floridi, L. (2025). Who is an AI ethicist? An empirical study of expertise, skills, and profiles to build a

- competency framework. *AI Ethics*, 5(4), 3713–3725. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s43681-024-00643-y>
- Cross, M. (2024). Limitations of transparency in democratising and regulating algorithmic management. In M. Ziosi, G. Sartor, J. M. Cunha, A. Trotta, & P. Wicke (Eds.), *AI for people, democratizing AI: CAIP 2023* (pp. 86–94). Springer. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-71304-0\\_7](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-71304-0_7)
- Dafoe, A., Bachrach, Y., Hadfield, G. K., Horvitz, E., Larson, K., & Graepel, T. (2021). Cooperative AI: Machines must learn to find common ground. *Nature*, 593(7857), 33–36. <https://doi.org/10.1038/d41586-021-01170-0>
- Dasgupta, N., & Musolesi, M. (2025). Investigating the impact of direct punishment on the emergence of cooperation in multi-agent reinforcement learning systems. *Autonomous Agents and Multi-Agent Systems*, 39(1), Article 19. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10458-025-09698-5>
- de Souza, S., & Bhardwaj, K. (2024). India’s conception of community data and addressing concerns for access to justice. *Digital Society*, 3(1), Article 16. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s44206-024-00102-5>
- Decker, M., Wegner, L., & Leicht-Scholten, C. (2025). Procedural fairness in algorithmic decision-making: The role of public engagement. *Ethics and Information Technology*, 27(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10676-024-09811-4>
- Dua, M., Singh, J. P., & Shehu, A. (2025). The ethics of national artificial intelligence plans: An empirical lens. *AI Ethics*, 5(4), 3803–3831. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s43681-025-00663-2>
- Eke, D., & Stahl, B. (2024). Ethics in the governance of data and digital technology: An analysis of European data regulations and policies. *Digital Society*, 3(1), Article 11. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s44206-024-00101-6>
- Farisco, M., Baldassarre, G., Cartoni, E., Leach, A., Petrovici, M. A., Rosemann, A., Salles, A., Stahl, B., & van Albada, S. J. (2024). A method for the ethical analysis of brain-inspired AI. *Artificial Intelligence Review*, 57(6), Article 133. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10462-024-10769-4>
- Gambelin, O. (2020). Brave: What it means to be an AI ethicist. *AI Ethics*, 1(1), 87–91. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s43681-020-00020-5>
- Gandorfer, D. (2022). Down and dirty in the field of play: Startup societies, cryptostatecraft, and critical complicity. *Law and Critique*, 33, 355–377. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10978-022-09327-0>
- Garcia, E. V. (2024). The Other in the machine: Diplomacy and the AI conundrum. *Place Branding and Public Diplomacy*, 21, 339–344. <https://doi.org/10.1057/s41254-024-00329-6>
- Gerstgrasser, M., Danino, T., & Keren, S. (2023). Selectively sharing experiences improves multi-agent reinforcement learning. In *Proceedings of the 2023 International Conference on Autonomous Agents and Multiagent Systems (AAMAS '23)* (pp. 2433–2435). International Foundation for Autonomous Agents and Multiagent Systems. <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.5555/3545946.3598958>
- Gil, R. M., Ryan, M., & García, R. (2025). Sovereignty by design and human values in agriculture data spaces. *Agriculture and Human Values*, 42(3), 1413–1438. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10460-024-10674-0>
- Guan, C., Xue, K., Fan, C., Chen, F., Zhang, L., Yuan, L., Qian, C., & Yu, Y. (2025). Open and real-world human-AI coordination by heterogeneous training with communication. *Frontiers of Computer Science*, 19, Article 194314. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11704-024-3797-6>

- Hagendorff, T. (2023). AI ethics and its pitfalls: Not living up to its own standards? *AI Ethics*, 3(1), 329–336. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s43681-022-00173-5>
- Huang, L. T. L., Papyshv, G., & Wong, J. K. (2025). Democratizing value alignment: From authoritarian to democratic AI ethics. *AI Ethics*, 5, 11–18. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s43681-024-00624-1>
- Keane, L., & Allen, R. E. (2022). Any-play: An intrinsic augmentation for zero-shot coordination. In *Proceedings of the 21st International Conference on Autonomous Agents and Multiagent Systems (AAMAS '22)* (pp. 853–861). International Foundation for Autonomous Agents and Multiagent Systems. <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.5555/3535850.3535946>
- Koster, R., Balaguer, J., Tacchetti, A., Weinstein, A., Zhu, T., Hauser, O., Williams, D., Campbell-Gillingham, L., Thacker, P., Botvinick, M., & Summerfield, C. (2022). Human-centred mechanism design with Democratic AI. *Nature Human Behaviour*, 6(10), 1398–1407. <https://doi.org/10.1038/s41562-022-01383-x>
- LaCroix, T., & Mohseni, A. (2022). The tragedy of the AI commons. *Synthese*, 200, Article 289. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11229-022-03763-2>
- Makandar, A. (2024). Digital surveillance capitalism and cities: Data, democracy and activism. *Humanities and Social Sciences Communications*, 11(1), Article 1533. <https://doi.org/10.1057/s41599-024-03941-2>
- Marvin, G., Tamale, M., Kanagwa, B., & Jjingo, D. (2023). Philosophical review of artificial intelligence for Society 5.0. In A. Yadav, S. J. Nanda, & M. H. Lim (Eds.), *Proceedings of International Conference on Paradigms of Communication, Computing and Data Analytics: PCCDA 2023* (pp. 1–15). Springer. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-99-4626-6\\_1](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-99-4626-6_1)
- McKee, K. R. (2024). Human participants in AI research: Ethics and transparency in practice. *IEEE Transactions on Technology and Society*, 5(3), 279–288. <https://doi.org/10.1109/TTS.2024.3446183>
- McKee, K. R., Bai, X., & Fiske, S. T. (2024). Warmth and competence in human-agent cooperation. *Autonomous Agents and Multi-Agent Systems*, 38(1), Article 23. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10458-024-09649-6>
- Mikhaylovskaya, A. (2024). Enhancing deliberation with digital democratic innovations. *Philosophy & Technology*, 37(1), Article 3. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s13347-023-00692-x>
- Montes, N. (2022). Engineering pro-social values in autonomous agents: Collective and individual perspectives. In D. Baumeister & J. Rothe (Eds.), *Multi-agent systems: EUMAS 2022* (pp. 431–434). Springer. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-20614-6\\_26](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-20614-6_26)
- Mun, J., Jiang, L., Liang, J., Chung, I., DeCario, N., Choi, Y., Kohno, T., & Sap, M. (2025). Particip-AI: A democratic surveying framework for anticipating future AI use cases, harms and benefits. In *Proceedings of the 2024 AAI/ACM Conference on AI, Ethics, and Society* (pp. 997–1010). AAAI Press. <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.5555/3716662.3716749>
- Noorman, M., & Swierstra, T. (2023). Democratizing AI from a sociotechnical perspective. *Minds & Machines*, 33(4), 563–586. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11023-023-09651-z>
- Okada, A., Sherborne, T., Panselinas, G., & Kolionis, G. (2025). Fostering transversal skills through open schooling supported by the CARE-KNOW-DO pedagogical model and the UNESCO AI competencies framework. *International Journal of Artificial Intelligence in Education*, 35(4), 1953–1998. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s40593-025-00458-w>
- Orzan, N., Acar, E., Grossi, D., & Rădulescu, R. (2024). Emergent cooperation under uncertain incentive alignment. In *Proceedings of the 23rd International Conference on*

- Autonomous Agents and Multiagent Systems (AAMAS '24)* (pp. 1521–1530). International Foundation for Autonomous Agents and Multiagent Systems. <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.5555/3635637.3663012>
- Orzan, N., Acar, E., Grossi, D., & Rădulescu, R. (2025). Learning in public goods games: The effects of uncertainty and communication on cooperation. *Neural Computing & Applications*, 37, 18899–18932. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00521-024-10530-6>
- Perera, I., de Nijs, F., & García, J. (2025). Learning to cooperate against ensembles of diverse opponents. *Neural Computing & Applications*, 37, 18835–18849. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00521-024-10511-9>
- Rachum, R., Nakar, Y., Tomlinson, B., Alon, N., & Mirsky, R. (2024). Emergent dominance hierarchies in reinforcement learning agents. In *Proceedings of the 23rd International Conference on Autonomous Agents and Multiagent Systems (AAMAS '24)* (pp. 2426–2428). International Foundation for Autonomous Agents and Multiagent Systems. <https://dl.acm.org/doi/10.5555/3635637.3663182>
- Ribeiro-Navarrete, B., Saura, J. R., & Simón-Moya, V. (2024). Setting the development of digitalization: State-of-the-art and potential for future research in cooperatives. *Review of Managerial Science*, 18(5), 1459–1488. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11846-023-00663-8>
- Sætra, H. S., Borgebund, H., & Coeckelbergh, M. (2022). Avoid diluting democracy by algorithms. *Nature Machine Intelligence*, 4(10), 804–806. <https://doi.org/10.1038/s42256-022-00537-w>
- Saheb, T., & Saheb, T. (2024). Mapping ethical artificial intelligence policy landscape: A mixed method analysis. *Science and Engineering Ethics*, 30(2), Article 9. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11948-024-00472-6>
- Sato, E., & Osawa, H. (2020). Reducing partner’s cognitive load by estimating the level of understanding in the cooperative game Hanabi. In T. Cazenave, J. van den Herik, A. Saffidine, & I.-C. Wu (Eds.), *Advances in computer games: ACG 2019* (pp. 11–23). Springer. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-65883-0\\_2](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-65883-0_2)
- Schrepel, T., & Potts, J. (2024). Measuring the openness of AI foundation models: Competition and policy implications. *Information & Communications Technology Law*, 34(3), 279–304. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13600834.2025.2461953>
- Shi, M., Wang, G., Zhang, S., Jiang, J., & Xiang, Y. (2025). AISCW: Artificial intelligence supported cooperative work: The new frontier of CSCW. In H. Sun, H. Fan, Y. Gao, X. Wang, D. Liu, B. Du, & T. Lu (Eds.), *Computer supported cooperative work and social computing: ChineseCSCW 2024* (pp. 3–17). Springer. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-96-2373-0\\_1](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-96-2373-0_1)
- Simões, M. A. C., da Silva, R. M., & Nogueira, T. A. (2020). A dataset schema for cooperative learning from demonstration in multi-robot systems. *Journal of Intelligent & Robotic Systems*, 99(3), 589–608. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10846-019-01123-w>
- Stathis, G., & van den Herik, J. (2025). Ethical and preventive legal technology. *AI Ethics*, 5(2), 1069–1086. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s43681-023-00413-2>
- Steinhoff, J. (2024). AI ethics as subordinated innovation network. *AI & Society*, 39(4), 1995–2007. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00146-023-01658-5>
- Su, E., Raffe, W., Mathieson, L., & Wang, Y. (2024). Better understanding of humans for cooperative AI through clustering. In *2024 IEEE Conference on Games (CoG)* (pp. 1–8). IEEE. <https://doi.org/10.1109/CoG60054.2024.10645647>
- Tartaro, A., Panai, E., & Cocchiari, M. Z. (2024). AI risk assessment using ethical dimensions. *AI Ethics*, 4(1), 105–112. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s43681-023-00401-6>

- Taylor, R. R., Murphy, J. W., Hoston, W. T., & Senkaiahliyan, S. (2025). Democratizing AI in public administration: Improving equity through maximum feasible participation. *AI & Society*, 40(5), 3653–3662. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00146-024-02120-w>
- Tomašev, N., Cornebise, J., Hutter, F., Mohamed, S., Picciariello, A., Connelly, B., Belgrave, D. C. M., Ezer, D., van der Haert, F. C., Mugisha, F., Abila, G., Arai, H., Almiraat, H., Proskurnia, J., Snyder, K., Otake-Matsuura, M., Othman, M., Glasmachers, T., de Wever, W., Teh, Y. W., Khan, M. E., De Winne, R., Schaul, T., & Clopath, C. (2020). AI for social good: Unlocking the opportunity for positive impact. *Nature Communications*, 11(1), Article 2468. <https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-020-15871-z>
- Trinidad, J. E. (2025). From accountability to algorithms: Interorganizational learning and the transformation of quantification in education. *Qualitative Sociology*, 48(2), 243–277. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11133-024-09590-w>
- Tsamados, A., Floridi, L., & Taddeo, M. (2024). Human control of AI systems: From supervision to teaming. *AI and Ethics*, 5, 1535–1548. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s43681-024-00489-4>
- Veitch, E., Dybvik, H., Steinert, M., & Alsos, O. A. (2024). Collaborative work with highly automated marine navigation systems. *Computer Supported Cooperative Work*, 33(1), 7–38. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10606-022-09450-7>
- Verdegem, P. (2022). Dismantling AI capitalism: The commons as an alternative to the power concentration of Big Tech. *AI & Society*, 39, 727–737. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00146-022-01437-8>
- von Schenk, A., Klockmann, V., & Köbis, N. (2023). Social preferences towards humans and machines: A systematic experiment on the role of machine payoffs. *Social Science Research Network*. <https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.4145868>
- Wang, L., Fu, F., & Chen, X. (2024). Mathematics of multi-agent learning systems at the interface of game theory and artificial intelligence. *Science China Information Sciences*, 67(6), Article 166201. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11432-024-3997-0>
- Woods, D. (2025). Stag hunt in the digital wilds: Legitimizing global AI governance amidst diverse terrains. *Fudan Journal of the Humanities and Social Sciences*, 19, 65–96. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s40647-025-00438-3>
- Xu, Z. (2022). From algorithmic governance to govern algorithm. *AI & Society*, 39(3), 1141–1150. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00146-022-01554-4>
- Zhang, L., Wu, J., Mumtaz, S., Li, J., Gacanin, H., & Rodrigues, J. J. P. C. (2019). Edge-to-edge cooperative artificial intelligence in smart cities with on-demand learning offloading. In *2019 IEEE Global Communications Conference (GLOBECOM)* (pp. 1–6). IEEE. <https://doi.org/10.1109/GLOBECOM38437.2019.9013878>
- Zheng, X., Zhou, G., & Zeng, D. D. (2023). Platform governance in the era of AI and the digital economy. *Frontiers of Engineering Management*, 10(1), 177–182. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s42524-022-0241-1>
- Zygmuntowski, J. O. (2023). Data governance in a trilemma: A qualitative analysis of rights, values, and goals in building data commons. *Digital Society*, 2(2), Article 30. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s44206-023-00058-y>